

Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission

1050 N. Highland Street • Suite 200A-N • Arlington, VA 22201 703.842.0740 • 703.842.0741 (fax) • www.asmfc.org

MEMORANDUM

TO: Atlantic Striped Bass Management Board

FROM: Emilie Franke, Plan Development Team Chair

DATE: April 29, 2025 *Table 1 Revised May 2, 2025 to include Wave 2

SUBJECT: Supplementary Analyses for Draft Addendum III

Enclosed are two supplementary analyses for Draft Addendum III on state-specific reduction estimates and kind of day closure analysis (weekend and weekday calculations). Due to time constraints, these results were not reviewed by the Plan Development Team (PDT) and Technical Committee (TC) and Stock Assessment Subcommittee (SAS).

State-Specific Reductions

The Board requested estimates of state-specific reductions for season closure options to understand how uniform closures across each ocean region would impact individual states. The draft addendum calculated options to achieve equal reductions by region. The only way to achieve equal reductions by state would be to calculate state-specific closures; the Board noted during the 2025 Winter Meeting that it did not want to pursue state-specific closures for the ocean.

Table 1 provides the estimated reductions by state for a 14-day closure in each wave. The reductions scale linearly, so a 28-day closure would result in double the reduction listed in the table. This table is intended to provide context on state-specific impacts from a regional closure. For example, in wave 3 for a 14-day no-targeting closure (striped bass only trips eliminated) for Maine through Massachusetts, the estimated reduction in Maine is 4.6%, in New Hampshire is 4.6%, and in Massachusetts is 5.8%.

The state-specific reductions depend on the distribution of harvest and releases by wave for each state, the type of removals in each state (percent harvest vs. percent release mortality), and the breakdown of trips that release striped bass for no-targeting closure calculations in each state (trips only targeting striped bass, trips targeting striped bass and another species, trips not targeting striped bass). Note that conducting these analyses at the state-level instead of the region-level reduces the sample size and increases the PSE and the uncertainty in the reduction calculations.

Kind of Day Closure Analysis

As noted in the TC-SAS March 2025 meeting summary included in the Board's <u>Main Materials</u>, the season closure analysis assumes a constant daily savings of harvest and/or releases but in

reality, catch is not constant per day. In particular, weekends/holidays tend to have higher effort and catch. The TC-SAS agreed a case study example incorporating weekend vs. weekday would be informative to determine how adding in the weekend/weekday aspect would impact the season closure analysis.

The season closure analysis for ocean-wide closures (all ocean states close during the same wave) was re-analyzed to separate MRIP catch data by kind of day as defined by MRIP with Monday-Thursday as weekdays and Friday-Sunday plus Federal Holidays as weekends. Note that conducting these analyses at the kind-of-day-level instead of combining data across all days reduces the sample size and increases the PSE and the uncertainty in the reduction calculations.

Table 2 summarizes the results for an example 18-day closure for all ocean states in each wave when:

1) accounting for weekend vs. weekday for a closure starting on a Monday;

2) accounting for weekend vs. weekday for a closure starting on a Friday;

3) base case (analysis does not take into account kind of day and data for all days are combined).

The results indicate a less than 1% difference between the analysis types, with the highest reduction estimated for a closure starting on a Friday (more weekend days closed) and the lowest reduction estimated for a closure starting on a Monday. The base case analysis used in the draft addendum combining data across all kinds of days (i.e., not separating weekend and weekday catch data) falls in between. This highlights one of the challenges of trying to account for kind of day in the closure analysis: the expected reduction will depend not just on the length of the closure, but on how many weekend days vs. weekdays are closed. The PDT discussed whether to specify in the draft addendum which day of the week to start a closure on, or include specific dates for closures, so the number of weekend days/holidays vs. weekdays would be known for this type of analysis. However, the PDT preferred not to do so in order to give the regions more flexibility in determining which closure would work for them. This analysis suggests that the uncertainty from different catch rates on different types of days may be minimal in the season closure analysis compared to other sources of uncertainty, especially when the closures are long enough to encompass both weekends and weekdays. The PDT and TC-SAS could discuss this analysis if requested by the Board.

| | State | No Target (SB only trips eliminated) | No Target (SB trips switch targets) | No Harvest |
|-----------|-------|--|---|------------|
| Wave 2 | Ocean | -4.0% | -3.4% | -1.6% |
| | ME | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | NH | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | MA | -0.1% | -0.1% | 0.0% |
| | RI | -2.0% | -1.4% | 0.0% |
| | СТ | -6.2% | -5.8% | 0.0% |
| | NY | -4.6% | -4.2% | -2.0% |
| | NJ | -6.4% | -5.6% | -3.1% |
| | DE | -1.4% | -0.4% | -0.7% |
| | MD | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | VA | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | NC | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |

Table 1. State-specific reductions for a 14-day season closure. Revised May 2, 2025 to include Wave 2

| | State | No Target (SB only trips eliminated) | No Target (SB trips switch targets) | No Harvest | | State | No Target (SB only trips eliminated) | No Target (SB trips switch targets) | No Harvest |
|-----------|-------|--|---|------------|------|-------|--|---|---------------|
| Wave 3 | Ocean | -3.8% | -2.8% | -2.0% | | Ocean | -3.1% | -2.2% | -1.5% |
| | ME | -4.6% | -2.8% | -1.1% | | ME | -7.5% | -6.2% | -1.0% |
| | NH | -4.6% | -1.2% | -0.9% | | NH | -3.8% | -2.8% | -1.1% |
| | MA | -5.8% | -2.9% | -2.3% | | MA | -4.2% | -2.9% | -2.0% |
| | RI | -7.5% | -6.0% | -2.9% | | RI | -4.8% | -3.9% | -1.9% |
| | СТ | -4.5% | -3.4% | -2.0% | Wave | СТ | -2.5% | -1.2% | -0.6% |
| | NY | -3.1% | -2.6% | -2.2% | 5 | NY | -3.5% | -3.0% | -2.5% |
| | NJ | -2.6% | -2.3% | -1.8% | | NJ | -1.8% | -1.4% | -1.0% |
| | DE | -0.9% | -0.1% | 0.0% | | DE | -0.2% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | MD | 0.9% | 0.9% | 0.0% | | MD | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | VA | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% | | VA | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | NC | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% | | NC | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | Ocean | -2.9% | -1.9% | -1.6% | | Ocean | -6.6% | -5.0% | -3.2% |
| Wave 4 | ME | -7.6% | -5.0% | -2.1% | Wave | ME | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | NH | -12.1% | -7.3% | -3.2% | | NH | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | MA | -7.3% | -3.7% | -4.6% | | MA | -0.6% | -0.5% | 0.0% |
| | RI | -3.2% | -2.3% | -2.0% | | RI | -2.2% | -1.7% | 0.0% |
| | СТ | -3.1% | -2.6% | -1.7% | | СТ | -3.8% | -3.5% | -0.1% |
| | NY | -2.0% | -1.7% | -1.4% | 6 | NY | -7.6% | -3.7% | -3.1% |
| | NJ | -0.1% | 0.0% | -0.1% | | NJ | -11.2% | -8.4% | -6.6% |
| | DE | -2.0% | -1.4% | -0.6% | | DE | -11.8% | -9.0% | -1.4% |
| | MD | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% | | MD | -14.1% | -13.8% | 0.0% |
| | VA | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% | | VA | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |
| | NC | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% | | NC | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% |

Table 2. Reduction estimates for an 18-day closure calculated 1) accounting for weekend vs. weekday for a closure starting on a Monday; 2) accounting for weekend vs. weekday for a closure starting on a Friday; 3) analysis for all days combined (does not take into account kind of day).

| 18-Day Closure | Wave | Weekend Closure Days | Weekday Closure Days | No Target (SB only trips eliminated) | No Target (SB trips switch targets) | No Harvest |
|--------------------------------------|------|-------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|------------|
| Closure starting on a Monday | 2 | 6 | 12 | -5.0% | -3.8% | -1.9% |
| Closure starting on a Friday | 2 | 9 | 9 | -5.4% | -4.3% | -2.2% |
| Closure calculated all days combined | 2 | 18 | | -5.2% | -4.4% | -2.1% |
| Closure starting on a Monday | 3 | 6 | 12 | -4.4% | -3.2% | -2.3% |
| Closure starting on a Friday | 3 | 9 | 9 | -5.4% | -4.1% | -2.8% |
| Closure calculated all days combined | 3 | 18 | | -4.9% | -3.6% | -2.6% |
| Closure starting on a Monday | 4 | 6 | 12 | -3.6% | -2.2% | -2.0% |
| Closure starting on a Friday | 4 | 9 | 9 | -3.9% | -2.6% | -2.1% |
| Closure calculated all days combined | 4 | 18 | | -3.8% | -2.5% | -2.1% |
| Closure starting on a Monday | 5 | 6 | 12 | -3.7% | -2.5% | -1.8% |
| Closure starting on a Friday | 5 | 9 | 9 | -4.1% | -2.9% | -2.0% |
| Closure calculated all days combined | 5 | 18 | | -4.0% | -2.8% | -2.0% |
| Closure starting on a Monday | 6 | 6 | 12 | -8.2% | -6.1% | -3.9% |
| Closure starting on a Friday | 6 | 9 | 9 | -8.8% | -6.6% | -4.3% |
| Closure calculated all days combined | 6 | 18 | | -8.5% | -6.4% | -4.1% |

Action Title

2025 Spring Meeting

Action URL

https://asmfc.org/events/2025-spring-meeting/

Name

Gerard Addonizio

Email

gaddoniz@med.cornell.edu

State

New York

Comment

I continue to discuss proposed changes for striped bass management with many fellow anglers. When I ask them about the no targeting proposal for striped bass they all invariably respond by saying that they will be fishing for blue fish. The no targeting of striped bass will not be enforceable. The only effective method would be to ban all fishing during certain periods. This would be a very painful solution but clearly the only realistic one regarding no targeting. A better solution would be to restrict harvesting more extensively and this should include for hire and commercial fishing. If commercial fishing is to be excluded, please make the requirements for a license more stringent so that only people who truly make a living this way can warrant a license.

Action Title

2025 Spring Meeting

Action URL

https://asmfc.org/events/2025-spring-meeting/

Name

David Bell

Email

dinger00a@hotmail.com

State

Maryland

Comment

Striped Bass Addendum

Dear Commissioners and Atlantic Striped Bass Management Board,

As a Maryland licensed fishing guide, I am writing to you regarding Maryland DNR's proposed conservation equivalency action to "reset the baseline" of Maryland's striped bass season.

This action includes expanding catch and release through April. In my view, this would be a reckless course of action while the Commission views the stock as overfished with poor recruitment. In my experience, fish drop their eggs after being fought and lifted from the water. We see anglers doing this frequently during the current catch and release seasons.

In 2024, Maryland closed May1-15 "out of an abundance of caution" when the majority of the female spawning stock has left the Bay. And now DNR is considering a complete reversal of regulations in April during the spawn. I fail to see how this makes any sense.

We have been repeatedly misled by DNR during the meetings considering this proposed "baseline change" that in order for fishing to resume May1-15, Maryland needs to reduce removals elsewhere during the season. After discussing this with Emile Franke, this doesn't appear to be true. It should be unnecessary to "pay back" a reduction that wasn't required under Addendum II.

If the board has to consider reductions with Addendum III, the proposed " Option 3 Modified" change to Maryland's season currently under consideration can't be a part of it in our view. Maryland hasn't allowed catch and release in April since 2019. How would the Commission's Plan Development Team make projections with no data from April for the past 5 years?

Finally, this is a conservation equivalency action under the guise of new terminology and is not permitted

under Addendum II. It would undermine the public's confidence in the management process.

For these reasons I'm absolutely opposed to Maryland's proposed conservation equivalency action.

Sincerely,

Dave Bell 410-218-7713

Action Title

2025 Spring Meeting

Action URL

https://asmfc.org/events/2025-spring-meeting/

Name

Mark Brown

Email

safarigirlcharters@yahoo.com

State

Maryland

Comment

Dear Commissioners and Atlantic Striped Bass Management Board,

As a Maryland licensed fishing guide, I am writing to you regarding Maryland DNR's proposed conservation equivalency action to "reset the baseline" of Maryland's striped bass season.

This action includes expanding catch and release through April. In my view, this would be a reckless course of action while the Commission views the stock as overfished with poor recruitment. In my experience, fish drop their eggs after being fought and lifted from the water. We see anglers doing this frequently during the current catch and release seasons.

In 2024 Maryland closed May1-15 "out of an abundance of caution" when the majority of the female spawning stock has left the Bay. Now DNR is considering a complete reversal of regulations in April during the spawn. I fail to see how this makes any sense.

We have been repeatedly misled by DNR during the meetings considering this proposed "baseline change" that in order for fishing to resume May1-15, Maryland needs to reduce removals elsewhere during the season. After discussing this with Emile Franke, this doesn't appear to be true. It should be unnecessary to "pay back" a reduction that wasn't required under Addendum II.

If the board has to consider reductions with Addendum III, the proposed " Option 3 Modified" change to Maryland's season currently under consideration can't be a part of it in our view. Maryland hasn't allowed catch and release in April since 2019. How would the Commission's Plan Development Team make projections with no data from April for the past 5 years?

Finally, this is a conservation equivalency action under the guise of new terminology and is not permitted under Addendum II. It would undermine the public's confidence in the management process.

For these reasons I'm absolutely opposed to Maryland's proposed conservation equivalency action.

Sincerely,

Mark Brown 410-207-8362

Action Title

2025 Spring Meeting

Action URL

https://asmfc.org/events/2025-spring-meeting/

Name

Captain. Robert Newberry

Email

rnewberry56@gmail.com

State

Maryland

Comment

I would like to address specific issues concerning striped bass management specifically items concerning Maryland.